

Nucleic Acid Relatedness Studies on the Genus *Carnobacterium* and Related Taxa

By MARIE-CHRISTINE CHAMPOMIER, MARIE-CHRISTINE MONTEL*
AND RÉGINE TALON

Station de Recherches sur la Viande, INRA, Theix 63122 Ceyrat, France

(Received 21 November 1988; revised 6 February 1989; accepted 9 February 1989)

None of the species *Carnobacterium carnis*, *C. divergens*, *C. mobile* or *C. gallinarum* showed significant DNA–DNA homology between themselves and other lactic acid bacteria. Nevertheless, the *Carnobacterium* species were found to belong to the same ribosomal RNA homology cluster. The species in this cluster were distant from the other bacteria tested.

INTRODUCTION

Collins *et al.* (1987) described a new genus, *Carnobacterium*, incorporating four species – *C. piscicola*, *C. divergens*, *C. mobile* and *C. gallinarum*. All had been isolated from meat, fish or poultry. *C. piscicola* had been described previously as *Lactobacillus piscicola* (Hiu *et al.*, 1984). The high DNA homology between *Lactobacillus carnis* strains (Shaw & Harding, 1986) and *C. piscicola* led to the proposal that *L. carnis* should be named *C. piscicola*. *C. divergens* included strains formerly called *Lactobacillus divergens* (Holzapfel & Gerber, 1983). *C. mobile* and *C. gallinarum* are the names proposed for one of the groups of ‘atypical lactobacilli’ described by Thornley & Sharpe (1959).

Peptidoglycan containing *meso*-diaminopimelic acid (mDAP) type is a feature common to all these taxa. It is also found in a few species of *Lactobacillus* and *Brochothrix*. Given the importance of this chemotaxonomic marker in phylogenetic studies (Stackebrandt & Woese, 1981) it is pertinent to study genetic relationships between all these taxa.

The aim of the present work was to determine the degree of relatedness between strains of *Carnobacteria* by measuring DNA–DNA homologies and RNA cistron similarities.

METHODS

Strains and growth conditions. The sources of the strains tested are given in Table 1. Strains were cultivated in MRS broth or All Purpose Tryptone (APT; Merck).

Isolation of DNA. After 18 h growth, cells were harvested and lysed according to the method described by Rocourt *et al.* (1982), except that the lysozyme concentration was increased (to 300 mg per 100 ml of lysate) and 500 units of mutanolysin (Sigma) were added. DNA was extracted and purified as described by Brenner *et al.* (1982).

DNA–DNA hybridization. DNA was labelled by nick-translation with [³H]ATP (925 GBq mmol⁻¹), [³H]GTP (625 GBq mmol⁻¹), [³H]CTP (977 GBq mmol⁻¹) and [³H]TTP (1.53 TBq mmol⁻¹) (Amersham). DNA–DNA hybridization was done at 60 °C following treatment with S₁ nuclease and precipitation with trichloroacetic acid (Grimont *et al.*, 1980).

Isolation of ribosomal 16S and 23S RNA. Ribosomal RNA (rRNA) was labelled *in vivo* and extracted according to the method described by Kilpper-Bälz & Schleifer (1981), with the following modifications. Cells were cultivated in 400 ml APT broth (Merck) supplemented with 18.5 MBq [5,6-³H]juracil (1.48 TBq mmol⁻¹; Amersham). They were harvested at the beginning of the stationary phase and suspended in 0.04 M-Tris/0.02 M-acetate buffer (7.2) containing 10 mM vanadyl ribonucleoside complex (VRC; Gibco BRL). After thawing overnight at 18 °C in the cylindrical chamber of an Xpress cells were disrupted by passage through the press at a pressure of 150 MPa. Nucleic acids were extracted with phenol/chloroform and precipitated by NaCl (0.5 M) and ethanol.

Abbreviation: mDAP, *meso*-diaminopimelic acid.

Table 1. *Designation and source of strains*

^T, type strain; ATCC, American Type Culture Collection, Rockville, Md., USA; DSM, Deutsche Sammlung von Mikroorganismen, Göttingen, FRG; NCDO, National Collection of Dairy Organisms, Reading, UK; Shaw, Dr B. G. Shaw, Institute of Food Research, Bristol, UK.

Name as received	Reference number	Isolated from:
<i>Lactobacillus carnis</i> = <i>Carnobacterium piscicola</i>	LV61 Shaw	} Vacuum-packed beef
<i>Lactobacillus divergens</i> = <i>Carnobacterium piscicola</i>	LV14 Shaw	
<i>Lactobacillus divergens</i> = <i>Carnobacterium divergens</i>	LV6 Shaw	
<i>Lactobacillus divergens</i> = <i>Carnobacterium divergens</i>	LV60 Shaw	
<i>Carnobacterium piscicola</i> ^T	NCDO 2762	Salmonid fish
<i>Carnobacterium gallinarum</i>	NCDO 2766	Chicken meat
<i>Carnobacterium mobile</i>	NCDO 2765	Irradiated chicken meat
<i>Lactobacillus plantarum</i> ^T	ATCC 14917	Pickled cabbage
<i>Lactobacillus yamanashiensis</i> ^T	DSM 20444	Apple juice from cider press
<i>Lactobacillus vaccinostrercus</i> ^T	DSM 20634	Cow dung
<i>Lactobacillus pentosus</i>	NCDO 363	Cow silage
<i>Lactobacillus maltaromicus</i> ^T	DSM 20342	Malt-flavoured milk
<i>Lactobacillus agilis</i> ^T	DSM 20509	Sewage
<i>Lactobacillus sharpae</i>	DSM 20205	Sewage
<i>Lactobacillus ruminis</i> ^T	DSM 20403	Bovine rumen
<i>Pediococcus pentosaceus</i>	DSM 20336	Beer yeast
<i>Leuconostoc mesenteroides</i>	DSM 20343	Fermenting olives
<i>Brochothrix thermospacta</i> ^T	ATCC 11509	Fresh pork sausage
<i>Brochothrix campestris</i> ^T	ATCC 43574	Soil
<i>Sporolactobacillus inulinus</i>	DSM 20348	Chicken feed

After separation on a 2.8 (w/v) polyacrylamide slab gel for 16 h (30 V, 15 mA) ribosomal RNAs were localized by the method of Hassur & Whitlock (1974), and purified by electro-elution for 6 h at 100 V in elution buffer consisting of 0.5 M-ammonium acetate, 1 mM-EDTA (pH 8).

The eluate was purified by extraction with phenol and precipitation with ethanol. After centrifugation at 10000g, the RNA pellet was dissolved in 2 × SSC (1 × SSC is 0.15 M-NaCl, 0.015 M-trisodium citrate, pH 7.0) and stored at -20 °C. The concentration was determined spectrophotometrically at 260 nm. The specific activity of ³H-labelled RNA from *C. piscicola* was 6000 c.p.m. (μg RNA)⁻¹.

DNA-RNA hybridization. Nitrocellulose filters (Sartorius) were loaded with 100 μg DNA. DNA was denatured by 30 min treatment with an equal volume of 1 M-NaOH, then, neutralized by addition of 1 vol. 1 M-HCl, 1 vol. 1 M-Tris/HCl (pH 8) and 2 vols 2 × SSC. This solution was allowed to pass through nitrocellulose under vacuum. Filters were baked in an oven for 3 h at 80 °C. DNA-rRNA hybridization and $T_{m(e)}$ values were determined according to the methods described by De Ley & De Smedt (1975).

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

DNA-DNA homologies between strains of *C. piscicola*, *C. divergens* and other species belonging to the genera *Carnobacterium*, *Lactobacillus*, *Pediococcus*, *Leuconostoc* and *Brochothrix* are shown in Table 2. It is apparent that *C. piscicola* and *C. divergens* are distantly related to other species of lactic acid bacteria (i.e. ≤ 22% homology). Moreover, the four species of the genus *Carnobacterium* share low homology towards DNA of *C. piscicola* and *C. divergens* (homology values < 15%). In view of these low values, it is difficult to conclude if these species are genuinely related at the genus level.

Results of DNA-rRNA hybridizations are shown in Table 3. Hybrids are characterized by the $\Delta T_{m(e)}$ value towards RNA of *C. piscicola*. This value is the most useful taxonomic parameter to measure RNA cistron similarity (De Vos *et al.*, 1985). It is apparent that all the *Carnobacterium* species belong to the same RNA homology group as revealed by the low range of $\Delta T_{m(e)}$, i.e. from 1 to 3 °C. Several authors (Gillis & De Ley, 1980; Stackebrandt *et al.*, 1981; Kilpper-Bälz & Schleifer, 1981) suggest that strains for which the $\Delta T_{m(e)}$ is less than 6 °C can be included in the same RNA homology group. The closest neighbour of *C. piscicola*, at a $\Delta T_{m(e)}$ of 5 °C, is *Lactobacillus plantarum*. No close genetic relationship was found between *C. piscicola*

Table 2. DNA-DNA relatedness between strains of *C. piscicola*, *C. divergens* and other lactic acid bacteria

Source of unlabelled DNA	Percentage relatedness with labelled DNA from:	
	<i>C. piscicola</i> LV61	<i>C. divergens</i> LV6
<i>C. piscicola</i> = <i>L. carnis</i> LV61	100	8
<i>C. piscicola</i> = <i>L. carnis</i> LV14	68	NT
<i>C. piscicola</i> NCDO 2762	80	6
<i>C. divergens</i> LV6	8	100
<i>C. divergens</i> LV60	10	82
<i>C. gallinarum</i> NCDO 2766	12	17
<i>C. mobile</i> NCDO 2765	10	8
<i>L. plantarum</i> ATCC 14917	4	2
<i>L. yamanashiensis</i> DSM 20444	7	3
<i>L. vaccinostercus</i> DSM 20634	5	NT
<i>L. pentosus</i> NCDO 363	6	2
<i>L. maltaromicus</i> DSM 20342	9	22
<i>L. agilis</i> DSM 20509	10	2
<i>L. sharpae</i> DSM 20205	11	NT
<i>L. ruminis</i> DSM 20403	7	2
<i>P. pentosaceus</i> DSM 20336	6	5
<i>Leuc. mesenteroides</i> DSM 20343	13	9
<i>B. thermosphacta</i> ATCC 11509	8	10
<i>S. inulinus</i> DSM 20408	11	NT

NT, Not tested

Table 3. Peptidoglycan type and nucleic acid relatedness of *Carnobacterium* spp. and other lactic acid bacteria

Filter-bound DNA from:	Peptidoglycan type	DNA G+C content (mol%)*	$\Delta T_{m(e)}$ of heteroduplex with 23S RNA from <i>C. piscicola</i> LV6
<i>C. piscicola</i> = <i>L. carnis</i> LV61	mDAP	35	0
<i>C. piscicola</i> = <i>L. carnis</i> LV14	mDAP	35	2
<i>C. piscicola</i> NCDO 2762, type strain	mDAP	34	0
<i>C. divergens</i> LV6	mDAP	35	3
<i>C. divergens</i> LV60	mDAP		2
<i>C. gallinarum</i> NCDO 2766	mDAP	37	1
<i>C. mobile</i> NCDO 2765	mDAP	37	1
<i>L. plantarum</i> ATCC 14917	mDAP	45	5
<i>L. yamanashiensis</i> DSM 20444	mDAP	33	7.5
<i>P. pentosaceus</i> DSM 20336	L-lys-L-ala-D-aspartic acid	38	7.5
<i>L. vaccinostercus</i> DSM 20634	mDAP	36	8
<i>L. pentosus</i> NCDO 363	mDAP	46	11.5
<i>L. maltaromicus</i> DSM 20342	mDAP	36	12
<i>B. thermosphacta</i> ATCC 11509	mDAP	36	13
<i>Leuc. mesenteroides</i>	L-ser-L-lys-L-ala2	37	14
<i>L. agilis</i> DSM 20509	mDAP	44	20

* Data from Bergey's Manual of Systematic Bacteriology (Sneath, 1986) and from Collins *et al.* (1987).

and other species containing mDAP in their cell wall except *Lactobacillus yamanashiensis*, which shows a $\Delta T_{m(e)}$ of 7.5 °C.

These genetic findings support the proposal of Collins *et al.* (1987) for the recognition of a new genus named *Carnobacterium*. The four member species, though sharing low overall genomic

similarity, form a phylogenetically coherent group, with the following characters: low G + C percentage (35 to 37%); mDAP in the cell wall; production of mainly L-lactate; no growth on acetate agar and synthesis of C18:1 ($\Delta 9:10$) instead of C18:1 ($\Delta 11:12$) (Collins *et al.*, 1987). Only these two latter features differentiate this genus from *Lactobacillus*.

REFERENCES

- BRENNER, D. J., MCWHORTER, A. C., LEETE KNUTSON, J. K. & STEIGERWALT, A. G. (1982). *Escherichia vulneris* a new species of *Enterobacteriaceae* associated with human wounds. *Journal of Chemical Microbiology* **15**, 1133–1140.
- COLLINS M. D., FARROW, A. E. F., PHILIPS, B. A., FERUSU, S. & JONES, D. (1987). Classification of *Lactobacillus divergens*, *Lactobacillus piscicola* and some catalase negative, asporogenous rod shaped bacteria from poultry in a new genus *Carnobacterium*. *International Journal of Systematic Bacteriology* **37**, 320–326.
- DE LEY, J. & DE SMEDT, J. (1975). Improvements of the membrane filter method for DNA-rRNA hybridization. *Antonie Van Leeuwenhoek* **41**, 287–307.
- DE VOS, P., GOOR, M., GILLIS, M. & DE LEY, J. (1985). Ribosomal ribonucleic acid cistron similarities of phytopathogenic *Pseudomonas* species. *International Journal of Systematic Bacteriology* **35**, 169–184.
- GILLIS, M. & DE LEY, J. (1980). Intra and intergenetic similarities of ribosomal ribonucleic cistrons of *Acetobacter* and *Gluconobacter*. *International Journal of Systemic Bacteriology* **30**, 7–27.
- GRIMONT, P. A. D., POPOFF, M. Y., GRIMONT, F., COYNAULT, C. & LEMELIN, M. (1980). Reproducibility and correlation studies of three deoxyribonucleic acid hybridization procedures. *Current Microbiology* **4**, 325–330.
- HASSUR, S. M. & WHITLOCK, H. W. (1974). UV shadowing a new and convenient method for the location of UV absorbing species in polyacrylamide gels. *Analytical Biochemistry* **59**, 162–164.
- HIU, S. R., HOLT, R. A., SRIRANGANATHAN, N., SEIDLER, R. J. & FRYER, J. L. (1984). *Lactobacillus piscicola*, a new species from salmonid fish. *International Journal of Systematic Bacteriology* **34**, 393–400.
- HOLZAPFEL, W. H. & GERBER, E. S. (1983). *Lactobacillus divergens* sp. nov. a new heterofermentative *Lactobacillus* species producing L(+) lactate. *Systematic and Applied Microbiology* **4**, 522–534.
- KILPPER-BÄLZ, R. & SCHLEIFER, K. H. (1981). DNA-rRNA hybridization studies among staphylococci and some other Gram positive bacteria. *FEMS Microbiology Letters* **10**, 357–362.
- ROCOURT, J., GRIMONT, F., GRIMONT, P. A. D. & SEELIGER, H. P. R. (1982). DNA relatedness among serovars of *Listeria monocytogenes sensu lato*. *Current Microbiology* **7**, 383–388.
- SHAW, B. G. & HARDING, C. D. (1984). A numerical taxonomic study of lactic acid bacteria from vacuum packaged beef, pork, lamb and bacon. *Journal of Applied Bacteriology* **56**, 25–40.
- SNEATH, P. H. A. (1986) (editor). *Bergey's Manual of Systematic Bacteriology*. Baltimore: Williams & Wilkins.
- STACKEBRANDT, E. & WOESE, C. R. (1981). Towards a phylogeny of the actinomycetes and related organisms. *Current Microbiology* **5**, 131–136.
- STACKEBRANDT, E., WUNNER-FUSSL, B., FOWLER, V. J. & SCHLEIFER, K. H. (1981). Deoxyribonucleic acid homologies and ribosomal ribonucleic acid similarities among sporeforming members of the order Actinomycetales. *International Journal of Systematic Bacteriology* **31**, 420–431.
- THORNLEY, M. J. & SHARPE, M. E. (1959). Microorganisms from chicken meat related to both lactobacilli and aerobic sporeformers. *Journal of Applied Bacteriology* **22**, 368–376.